Chapter Contents

Introduction	5-1
Roles and Responsibilities	5-2
Developing Agency Policies on Employee Movement	5-3
Sample Agency Policy	5-6
Filling Positions in the WMS	5-7
Step 1: Evaluate Requirements for Successful Job Performance	5-9
Step 2: Determine How to Reach a Diverse, Qualified Candidate Pool	5-12
Step 3: Determine How to Assess Candidates	5-15
Step 4: Consider Cost Effectiveness of Selection Options	5-19
Step 5: Conduct the Recruitment and Assessment	5-21
Step 6: Monitor and Evaluate the Recruitment	5-26
Step 7: Record the Results and Notify DOP	5-27
Sample Form for Reporting Appointments to DOP	5-28
Acting Appointments to WMS Positions	5-29
WMS Job Information Clearinghouse	5-30
Sample WMS Skill Bank Request Form	5-32
Resources	5-33
Sample Recruitment Scenarios	5-35
Use of Outside Assistance in Employee Selection	5-36

Introduction

The statute creating the Washington Management Service (RCW 41.06.500) significantly alters the traditional hiring policies for civil service managers. It calls for the establishment of:

"...flexible recruitment and hiring procedures that enable agencies to compete effectively with other employers, both public and private, for managers with appropriate skills and training; allowing consideration of all qualified candidates for positions as managers; and achieving affirmative action goals and diversity in the work place."

WAC 356-56 provides a general framework for recruitment, selection, and employee movement in the Washington Management Service. In addition, each agency will need to develop policies and procedures that will address their particular needs.

WAC 356-56-200 (1) states that:

"Policies and procedures for recruitment and selection will be inherently flexible, permitting methods and strategies to be varied and customized for each recruitment and selection need. In all aspects of recruitment and selection, no agency policy or procedure shall be negotiated or agreed to if it will reduce the agency's flexibility and discretion in filling a position or moving an employee..."

This rule is intended to ensure that agencies gain the full benefits embodied in the Washington Management Service, and to avoid putting agencies in positions of negotiating away their rights to flexibility.

The guidelines in this chapter are intended to facilitate development of those agency specific policies and procedures, and to provide useful information to support agencies in meeting their recruitment and selection needs.

For further information and assistance regarding recruitment, selection, and employee movement in the WMS, contact:

Personnel Services Division Department of Personnel 521 Capitol Way South Olympia, WA 98504-7500 (360) 586-2366

I Roles and Responsibilities

Direction for the decentralization of recruitment and selection activities is both in the law establishing the Washington Management Service and in the WAC 356-56-200 providing a general framework for recruitment and selection. At the same time, the Department of Personnel will continue to provide support to agencies. The general roles of the various affected parties include:

Department of Personnel

- Provide consultation, guidance, and technical assistance to support agencies in determining the best methods for meeting particular recruitment and selection needs.
- Upon agency request, provide a listing of potential applicants from those who have registered with the WMS Job Information Clearinghouse.
- Provide information to applicants on WMS openings that agencies choose to list with the Department of Personnel.

State Agencies

- Develop policies and procedures for recruitment and selection for their WMS positions.
- Develop and administer recruitment plans and selection tools for filling WMS positions.
- Respond to information requests from applicants. Support career development for employees who may promote into WMS positions.
- Develop and meet goals and objectives for affirmative action and workforce diversity.
- Maintain records on applicant flow, appointments, and employee movement.

<u>Individual WMS Managers</u>

- Seek out opportunities for career advancement.
- Determine what knowledge, skills, and abilities are needed for advancement.
- Work out career development plan with supervisor.
- Make interests known to hiring supervisors.

5-2 2/12/96

Developing Agency Policies on Employee Movement

This section provides guidance on the development of internal agency policies and procedures regarding employee movement and Washington Management Service positions. This is neither a mandatory nor an exhaustive list. Some agencies will need more policies and procedures; others less.

As each agency begins developing its WMS recruitment and selection policies, it is important to keep several concepts in mind:

- Agency procedures should be broad to promote a maximum amount of flexibility to serve particular client, employee, and organizational needs.
- Policies should be written to facilitate administration of WMS within each particular agency.
- Policies and procedures for employee movement should permit methods or strategies customized around each recruitment and selection need.
- Agencies should not be encumbered by preset, inflexible procedures of an absolute nature.
- It is not necessary, nor desirable, to replicate Merit System Rules or other traditional personnel procedures.
- Flexibility, as intended by the Legislature, should not be compromised.

In all areas of recruitment and selection, policies and procedures should allow discretion with regard to each recruitment and selection action.

The following pages cover some topics agencies may wish to cover in internal policies and procedures. Key principles to consider when developing these policies and procedures include:

- Selection of the best person
- Enhancement of workforce diversity
- Cost effectiveness of recruitment and selection procedures
- Fairness in procedures and decision-making

Career Opportunities for Promotional Employees

Many agencies already have career paths defined for promotional employees. Some have instituted succession planning, particularly for key or specialized positions. In many agencies, civil service managerial positions traditionally have been filled promotionally. Promotional preference has been a predominant feature of past civil service law and regulations.

How will this change under WMS? Much will depend on each agency's internal policies and the needs of individual positions as they are filled. While the new law promotes employee mobility, it does not require promotional preference. As agencies determine how to fill WMS positions, it will be important to strike a balance between retaining flexibility and options, and providing career advancement opportunities to employees.

Some questions to consider:

- How will the new possibilities afforded under the WMS affect career paths?
- Will employees need to rethink their strategies to compete for WMS positions? Will they need training in this area?
- How should succession planning be handled? When is it an appropriate strategy and when is it not? How does the agency decide who to include in succession planning?
- Should there be an agency policy on promotional opportunity? Would such a policy enhance or inhibit workforce diversity and other selection options?
- Should vacancies always be announced to agency employees or are there situations where this is not necessary? (e.g., when employees do not possess specialized skills needed; when someone has already been trained for a particular position). What will be the effect of these choices on selection costs? How do we strike a balance between efficient recruitment/selection and employee morale/inclusion?
- When might limiting recruitment to promotional applicants be the best? When would it not meet position or agency needs?

Transfers

Permanent employees who are in either the General Service or the WMS may request a transfer to a WMS position at the same salary level. (See Chapter 4 for more information on salary levels).

Agencies may also transfer an incumbent or a position with an incumbent to meet organizational needs. In this case, it is important to consider the desires and needs of the employee as well as what is reasonable for that job and geographic area.

For example, a 35-mile commute may be a hardship or an unusual requirement in one area due to traffic and time but take much less effort and be considered reasonable and common in another. This should be decided on a case by case basis, and will depend on factors such as commuting time, traffic conditions, average commuting conditions for the location, and profession. The time, distance, and conditions of travel from the employees home to the new work station is the key.

Example: John D. drives 20 miles north to Office A. He is transferred to Office B, which is 25 miles further north. While the transfer from Office A to Office B is only 25 miles, the commute for John is now 45 miles.

It may be useful for agencies to define what factors will be considered to determine whether a particular transfer is reasonable.

If organizational needs demand the transfer of an incumbent beyond a reasonable commute, and the incumbent does not accept the requirements, then the transfer cannot be forced. If the position must be moved and the incumbent's position is eliminated in its current location, then reduction-in-force rules would apply.

Permanent or temporary transfers, "outplacements," or employee "exchanges" between agencies are allowed, but the reasonable commute applies in these cases as well. Also, while the employee's consent should be a goal in all cases, it is not required.

Many agencies already have policies pertaining to intra- and interagency transfers. These will need to be reviewed to determine which of the practices for the General Service are applicable to WMS positions, which policies need modification, and what, if any, new policies will be created to cover WMS positions.

Some issues to consider regarding transfer policies include:

- Are current policies applicable or not? Why?
- Do current policies support the increased flexibility required by WMS?
- Should all staff be notified when vacancies occur so potential transfer candidates can make themselves known? If so, in all cases? What, if any, exceptions are appropriate?
- How will transfer applicants from other agencies be considered? Should they be considered?
- Will transfers between the General Service and WMS be any different than those within WMS?
- How will transfer candidates be evaluated? Using the same criteria as promotional or outside applicants?
- When considering transferring a position with an incumbent, how will a reasonable commuting distance be determined? By geographic area? By job type? On a case-by-case basis?
- How will other measures of reasonableness be determined?
- How will disagreements be handled to try to attain consensus? [Note: WAC 356-56-600 specifies "transfer that is alleged to be an unreasonable commute" as an action that is appealable to the Personnel Appeals Board.]

■Sample Agency Policy

Subject: Recruitment and Selection

- The hiring supervisor has the authority and the accountability for all recruitment and appointment actions for positions in the Washington Management Service (WMS). Hiring decisions will be based on fair, objective criteria and on the job-related characteristics required for the position.
- Agency positions will be advertised internally, when appropriate, to allow staff opportunities for mobility, promotion, and career development.
- The hiring supervisor, with guidance from the Human Resources Manager, will determine the most appropriate recruitment and selection methods on a case-by-case basis. The supervisor may choose to consider only agency promotional and transfer candidates, or may choose to advertise for state-wide promotional and open-competitive candidates.
- The hiring supervisor must consider affirmative action needs when filling the position. All appointments will be made without discrimination on the basis of race, color, creed, national origin, political affiliation, gender, age, marital status, sexual orientation, or the presence of any sensory, mental, or physical disability.
- The hiring supervisor has the authority to make acting appointments. Agency staff will be considered for acting appointments prior to considering interagency or open-competitive candidates. Consideration will be given to upward mobility, cross-training, workforce diversity, and employee development opportunities for agency staff when filling acting appointments.

I Filling Positions in the WMS

Evaluating the Need for the Position:

As with any position that becomes vacant, the first step is to evaluate how this WMS position is being used. Questions to consider include:

- Is the position still needed? If so, is it needed permanently or on an interim basis?
- If so, are the current duties appropriate?
- Is the position appropriately evaluated?
- Is the compensation level appropriate?
- Should the position be used at a higher level? At a lower level?
- Would organizational goals be better met by transferring the position elsewhere?
- Could the duties be distributed among other positions to streamline service delivery and improve operational efficiencies?

Planning for the Recruitment and Selection of the Best Candidates

Once it has been determined that the position will be filled, there are a myriad of possibilities for recruiting and selecting the best candidates. The best recruitment plans are developed in advance and meet the organization's needs by identifying and attracting diverse and skilled employees.

Successful recruitment and assessment of management level employees requires the person making the hiring decision to take a major role in the process. Besides the final selection of candidates, the decision maker should also be involved in:

- Assessing the needs of the department/agency and identifying the essential skills required to meet those needs.
- Being sensitive to the possible interests of internal employees and the effects of selection decisions on morale, productivity, and service delivery "downstream."
- Understanding and addressing any factors that may limit the attractiveness of the agency's jobs or limit the candidate pool.
- Marketing the position, the agency, and the state to candidates.
- Organizing and directing a professional and credible search and assessment process.

The ultimate goal of recruitment and assessment is to provide qualified candidates for the position in question. The person preparing the recruitment and assessment plan must analyze all relevant factors, including the cost, efficiency, and effectiveness of different alternatives.

Decide what needs to be done, who will do it, and when. Decide when the position needs to be filled and work backward to develop a time line. Try to be flexible: what is learned during the analysis of the situation may cause the time line to be altered. Balance what it takes to get a quality employee with the need to have the position filled. Consider whether the position should be filled temporarily to give time to find the right person.

The following steps will facilitate successful planning of a recruitment and selection strategy tailored to the organization's needs:

- Step 1: Evaluate requirements for successful job performance
- Step 2: Determine how to reach a diverse, qualified candidate pool
- Step 3: Determine how to assess candidates
- Step 4: Consider cost effectiveness of selection options
- Step 5: Conduct the recruitment and assessment
- Step 6: Monitor and evaluate the recruitment
- Step 7: Record results and notify DOP

Step 1: Evaluate Requirements for Successful Job Performance

The first step in the recruitment and selection plan is identification of skills and other requirements for successful job performance. A systematic look at the job helps one take into consideration all of the important elements and keep them in perspective. A good analysis of job requirements at the beginning will ordinarily save more than it will cost. An employee who is not well matched to the job requirements performs poorly; requires extra supervision and extra training; produces less; affects overall morale, productivity, operational costs, and service delivery; and is more likely to have to be replaced soon.

A job analysis (also called "job review" or "scoping a job") can take many forms. It may be an informal process covering key questions or one of the formal techniques available. Regardless of the process used, the results must specify what is done on the job, and what knowledge, skills, abilities, and other work characteristics and behaviors (KSAOs) distinguish superior performers from other candidates. In addition, the working environment, the level of training expected of a new hire, and the type of supervision the employee will receive should also be identified.

A sample of questions to ask is provided on page 5-11. A comprehensive listing of the knowledge, skills, and abilities (KSAs) critical for management success is provided in Chapter 1 (page 1-5). These critical KSAs provide a good starting point for evaluating managerial positions. Agencies can add, delete, and provide emphasis based on the requirements of specific positions or job groupings.

Make sure that the KSAOs are actually required to accomplish the objectives of the position, rather than being needed for the way the job is usually done. Don't automatically assume that qualities the other incumbents have are required for outstanding performance.

Consider whether the candidate must have all these qualities at the time of hire, or whether it makes sense to have the candidate learn some of them on the job. When considering credentials, consider whether candidates can demonstrate the qualifications some other way.

Also take into account proposed goals the agency has identified. These may be affirmative action goals, career development pathways, or other commitments. Determining how to address all these needs will provide the basis for a productive recruitment.

A good analysis will specify the characteristics a person needs to do the job well. Some of the needed characteristics will be obvious without a thorough job analysis but, without a systematic approach, it is easy to overlook some crucial requirements while concentrating on the obvious ones. It is also more difficult to explain final hiring decisions if challenged.

In summary, the analysis should cover several aspects of the job, such as:

- The job duties, with essential functions identified.
- Competencies and characteristics needed for successful job performance.
- Amount of orientation that may be provided before the employee should be fully productive.
- How the job fits into the organization.
- New roles or directions within the agency.
- Particular problems, commitments, or other issues that may affect the success of recruitment and assessment efforts.

Fully scoping the job will provide the most accurate picture of the best person to fill the position.

Salary Setting for Recruitment

Another important step in the job analysis is determining the salary level for the position. Many of the questions included in the sample job analysis questionnaire on page 5-11 also apply in determining the position's salary. For more information on salary determination, refer to the guidelines discussed in Chapter 4 (Compensation).

A manager may want to indicate a general salary amount or range of compensation for recruitment purposes with a final salary rate based on the candidate pool and specific experience and training of the selected candidate.

5-10 2/12/96

SAMPLE JOB ANALYSIS QUESTIONNAIRE

- What tasks are performed?
- ♦ Which tasks are the most difficult? The most critical?
- ♦ What are other expectations for this job?
- What are the reporting relationships?
- ♦ What is the working environment?
- ◆ Are there other important conditions of employment? (e.g., rotating shifts; uniforms)
- ◆ Are there other organizational needs? (e.g., Affirmative Action goals, career ladder considerations, certain approaches that have been unsuccessful in the past?)
- What knowledge, skills, abilities, and other work characteristics and behaviors (KSAOs) are needed to perform the job?
- ♦ Which KSAOs distinguish good performers from poor performers?
- ♦ Which KSAOs are the most critical to successful performance and need to be part of the assessment?
- ◆ Which KSAOs are needed at time of hire? Are there some characteristics all candidates will have?
- Which KSAOs can be learned on the job and don't need to be part of initial assessment?
- What hiring problems have been experienced in the past?

Step 2: Determine How to Reach a Diverse, Qualified Candidate Pool

Targeting the Candidate Source

Once the needs of the position and agency are understood, the next step is to decide who and where the target group of candidates may be. Where did the previous incumbent (or coworkers) come from? Were they good performers? Are there new needs or requirements? Once the particular candidate group is targeted, advertising efforts can be focused in that direction.

Achieving affirmative action goals and diversity in the work place are important parts of the Washington Management Service. Deciding which goals need to be met can also influence the recruitment effort.

Sometimes traditional recruitment may not be the best way to meet the agency's need to fill a position. A career path or succession planning for personnel within the agency or other state agencies may be the best approach for some positions.

When appropriate, internal career paths can greatly reduce the inefficiencies of unnecessary recruiting and training of outside candidates. Career paths provide several benefits to an agency:

- **■** Favorable employee morale
- Appropriate numbers of candidates
- Reduced production time losses
- Timely hiring
- Thorough information about the candidates
- Quality appointments

When recruitment outside the agency is the most appropriate strategy, possibilities for locating candidates include:

- The candidate skill bank at the WMS Job Information Clearinghouse located at the Department of Personnel (See page 5-30 for more information on the Clearinghouse.)
- Other managers, agencies, or local jurisdictions who may have recently conducted similar searches
- Other state or government agencies
- Private sector organizations
- Protected group organizations or networks

5 - 12 2/12/96

- DOP Executive Search services
- Professional organizations or networks
- Colleges and universities
- Career days, or professional meetings, conferences, or seminars, etc.
- Word of mouth
- Referencing and sourcing techniques
- Ads in newspapers, professional journals, or newsletters
- Specific mailing lists
- Announcements on electronic mail or bulletin boards
- Public service radio or cable
- Telephone networking

As part of defining where to search for appropriate candidates, consideration will need to be given to time and expense parameters. Also ensure that the search will identify a diverse candidate pool.

Announcing the Job Opening

How the job opening is announced strongly influences the success of the recruitment. An announcement that attracts 250 applicants is more trouble than it is worth if it requires staff to sort through stacks of unnecessary applications. If the best candidates are internal and already know what the job entails, a brief message via electronic mail, voice message, memo or in person may be the best announcement.

When a more formal announcement is needed, it should be worded so that it attracts the best candidates and discourages unqualified candidates. The announcement should clearly describe both the attractive and unattractive aspects of the job. Aspects that are unattractive to some candidates will be attractive to others, or else will be balanced out by attractive aspects.

The key to identifying the recruiting or applicant base is to guard against "process over outcome." Do what will produce the desired outcome—good candidates. Don't do something just because "we always do" or "somebody else did." Don't make candidates jump through unecessary hoops. Do what will work for the situation at hand. In general, guard against patterns of exclusion, especially along diversity lines.

Recruitment announcements should be informative but short. Good candidates will not wait around to read lengthy, tedious documents. The announcements should be published and circulated where they will best reach the applicant base.

The locations and frequency of openings and the availability of candidates are determining factors in deciding how and where to recruit. If there are plenty of good candidates within an agency, a restricted recruitment will still do the job. Where candidates are not so plentiful, recruitment efforts will need to be broadened accordingly.

The combination and applicability of the various advertising techniques available are very broad and depend upon the peculiarity of each individual case.

If Paid Advertising Is Being Considered, What Type Will Be Best?

The most common advertisement is the classified ad. They are particularly useful when targeting specific geographic areas or when there is uncertainty "where" the applicant base for a position is. However, classified ads may not be cost effective. Consider how much the prospective ads cost versus the likelihood of the ad generating a sufficient number of quality candidates.

Another consideration is time. Is there enough time in the recruitment period to allow for the proposed ad? Local classified ads can be placed quickly in most instances. However, regional or national advertisements require more lead time and professional journals more yet.

To be worthwhile, an advertisement must be placed where it reaches people with the level of expertise you expect the candidate to bring to the job. Direct your announcement to the source of the best applicants. This may be a professional organization, a training institute, or a specialized publication. Don't feel you have to advertise in writing. You may get good results speaking to people close to possible candidates.

Step 3: Determine How to Assess Candidates

How qualifications will be assessed plays a key role in the recruitment. It affects the scheduling of recruitment steps, the method of announcing, and what information the announcement asks the applicant to provide.

Don't guess about whether a candidate is qualified. There are many ways to assess a candidate's skills and to verify that the candidate will use them. An interview can be adapted to assess all sorts of qualities. Performing tasks that are part of the job can demonstrate many attributes. Background checks can be especially useful when they obtain information from various sources and contain questions about what the person did, rather than questions about whether the person is good.

A good assessment strategy will help you determine who the best candidates are, and how they will be evaluated. When designing the assessment, be sure to use the job analysis and involve individuals who are knowledgeable about the job being filled. Different positions will require different assessment approaches.

About "Minimum Qualifications"

The WMS rules do not require traditional selection processes such as the use of minimum qualifications. It is the discretion of each agency to use minimum qualifications and under what conditions. In making this determination, there are some important issues to consider.

Minimum qualifications are a very rough cut, but they are efficient in helping make firm pass/fail determinations. Nonetheless, the agency will usually be better served by more flexibility (unless certain requirements are mandated by law). When minimum qualifications or requirements for a vacancy are established, so, often, are barriers to filling it.

Excessive, restrictive credential and experience requirements may serve to unnecessarily limit the potential pool of highly capable candidates including persons of disabilities or female and minority candidates. Hiring authorities should guard against the use of excessive minimum requirements not truly needed for success in the position. Allow other phases of the selection process to measure candidate qualifications. Focus on KSAOs needed rather than specific experience or education.

Assess KSAOs at the Level Needed in the Position

In addition to identifying the qualities a candidate needs, specify the level at which those characteristics are needed. For example, a job may require a person who speaks Spanish. But what proficiency in Spanish is required? Does the person have to translate legal documents or scientific terms, or does the person greet clients and conduct them to their appointments? Assessment should be very different in these two cases.

Requiring more fluency in Spanish than the job needs may screen out the candidates who fit the job best and screen in candidates who would feel their talents are wasted. A decision about level is just as important if the quality assessed is ability to interview, persuasiveness, or knowledge of statistics.

Requiring a level beyond what is needed unnecessarily excludes candidates, and may be biased, or contribute to high turnover.

Design Assessment Procedures that Are Sensitive to Differences in the Candidate Population

When developing assessment tools, pose questions so that the average performance of qualified applicants falls in the middle range; so that there is lots of room for better and poorer performance than that of the typical candidate. No matter how job-related, a situation in which everyone gets full credit, or everyone gets no credit, is useless.

Be Conscious of and Eliminate the Effect of Biases and Other Unrelated Factors

Don't allow particular experiences to affect the rating if persons without those qualifications may be equally qualified. Knowledge of a system used in the current position tells little about eventual success in the position if the system can be learned in a short time. Knowledge of a particular jargon or theories that can be easily learned on the job have little to do with competence. Be aware of biases towards "sameness" and open to the value of differences which can enrich organizational diversity and service delivery.

One of the most direct ways to eliminate bias is by making sure that the assessment is fair, and based on job-related factors. For example, don't require a degree, specialized experience, or in-house knowledge if it is not essential. It is also important to eliminate situations or assumptions based on stereotypes. Be open to different ways in which candidates can show their abilities. Be prepared to alter formats to accommodate candidates with disabilities. Include clients and other "outsiders" in the selection process and design. Finally, make sure language usage is non-offensive. EEOC federal guidelines and Human Rights Commission law and guidelines provide additional information on nondiscrimination in selection.

Design Procedures that Best Fit the Needs of the Particular Recruitment.

There are many kinds of assessment options available. Some of the more familiar techniques are resume reviews, supplemental applications, oral interviews, reference checks, hiring committees, and performance tests. Less frequently used techniques include peer reviews, assessment centers, bio data instruments, and psychological testing. These approaches may be used individually or in combination.

5-16 2/12/96

Each technique has its advantages and disadvantages. Some are very quick, and others more labor intensive. Some are inexpensive to develop and administer; others can be costly. Each selection method can provide some good information about candidates, but perhaps not as well or as thoroughly as is needed in a particular situation. In deciding what approach will best meet the particular needs, it is important to balance the following concerns:

- What do I need to find out about candidates?
- What is the best method for assessing what I need?
- Have certain tools been successful or problematic with our targeted applicant pool?
- Will one tool give me what I need, or will I need multiple steps?
- How much time and expertise will it take to develop and administer the tools I think will work best?
- What is the cost-effectiveness of the methods proposed?
- How much time do I have to make my hiring decision?
- How many candidates do I expect?
- Where are candidates located?
- What will candidates accept?
- What expertise is available for designing a sound procedure?
- What expertise is needed and available for actually conducting the assessment?

Establish Clear and Consistent Rating Criteria

It is important to know against what yardstick candidates are being measured. Establishing rating criteria will ensure that those involved in the assessment process have a common understanding of the candidate qualities you are seeking. This can be as straightforward as making sure all raters have reached a consensus on what constitutes a good candidate. Or, a more structured approach with rating values may be best for some selection situations. Examples are available in DOP booklets on oral exams and interviewing (see the Resources listing beginning on page 5-34). DOP Personnel Services Division staff can also provide other examples or assistance.

Ensure that Various Factors Carry the Appropriate Weight in Candidate Appraisal

Exceptional suitability on a crucial factor may seem to compel the choice of a candidate, but it is important to determine how the candidate compares on all the important requirements. It is easy to let the last observation of the candidate sway the decision. Or perhaps the decision maker has full knowledge of only the last observation. The decision maker must consider information that allows comparison of the candidates on all the variables that affect performance.

Step 4: Consider Cost Effectiveness of Selection Options

When determining the optimum recruitment and assessment plan, it is important to weigh the costs and benefits of various options. Some considerations include:

Potential costs

- Advertisement costs
- Distribution costs
- Travel costs (job fairs, conferences, candidate travel, etc.)
- Lost production in the agency because of the vacancy or recruitment period
- Turnover due to poor selection
- Appeals, questions regarding validity, if assessment is not appropriate
- Long-term costs of dealing with a poor employee if assessment doesn't identify best candidates
- Non-usable or out-of-date hiring pool if recruitment is not done well or takes too long

Potential benefits

- Quality candidate pools
- Quality appointments
- Improved service/production due to good selections
- Appropriate number of candidates
- Favorable public and candidate relations
- Timely hiring lists
- Reduced production losses or "down time"
- Acceptability with candidates, workforce, management, labor groups, and agency staff

The costs in time, effort, and resources must be compared to the potential quality and usefulness of the resulting pool of candidates. Sometimes minor adjustments in the recruitment plan can lead to major improvements in outcomes. Consider the following examples:

Example 1: Assume you have a position for which you have determined you need to recruit outside of your agency. You are aware of several good potential

candidates in nearby local government agencies and others in the private sector throughout the state. In this case, using the General Service distribution would be economical, but not reach much of your targeted audience. An ad in the Wall Street Journal would be very expensive; although it may net some good candidates, it is not necessary if you have already identified several who are located locally.

A more cost-effective approach would be a consideration of specific mailing lists, personal contacts, and perhaps a brief ad in one or two of the state's major newspapers.

Example 2: Number of candidates, time, and information needed are key factors in designing the candidate assessment method. A two-day assessment center may provide excellent in-depth information, but would be time consuming and expensive even for a small number of candidates. Alternatively, a resume review to determine top candidates, and a structured oral interview combined with reference checking could give the information needed in substantially less time and at a lower cost.

Step 5: Conduct the Recruitment and Assessment

The following is a comprehensive checklist to facilitate the conduct of an efficient and effective recruitment and selection strategy. Incorporated in this checklist is a recap of key planning and analysis issues for a successful recruitment effort.

Considerations for determining the applicant base and recruitment sources:		
	What are the essential duties of the job that needs to be filled?	
	What are the knowledge, skills, abilities, and other work characteristics and behaviors candidates will need to meet?	
	Where will potential candidates be found? How many will be needed?	
	Has there been any succession planning?	
	Are there RIF's, reversions, transfers, etc. to consider?	
	Are there "feeder" jobs, e.g., career ladders, or series of jobs inside the agency or elsewhere in state government?	
	Can other employees/recruiters/personnel officers (inside and outside state government) provide qualified candidates?	
	What do previous or related recruitment histories tell about the numbers of candidates attracted in the past?	
	Can the DOP Workforce Diversity Unit or community-based groups provide candidates?	
	Is the WMS Job Information Clearinghouse (WMS skills bank located at DOP) a good source of qualified candidates?	
Factors t	o consider in determining timing and duration of recruitment:	
	Does a current or projected vacancy indicate a need to recruit immediately, next month, next year, etc.?	
	How many positions exist, and what is the turnover rate?	
	Is the candidate pool readily available or will information need to go to several locations or sources?	
	Should timing be tied to seasons, graduations, market conditions, etc.?	
	What is the anticipated volume of applications? How long were previous recruitments and what were the results?	

	How long should the recruitment extend: 1 week, 2 weeks, 1 month, continuous, indefinite, or some other length of time?
	Note: If past recruitment resulted in an oversupply of candidates, shorten the recruitment time or recruit less often. If it is difficult to attract enough good candidates, or a particular position has a high turnover, recruitment may need to be for a longer period of time or more frequent.
nside tribut	erations for reaching the recruitment base and determining the breadth of tion:
	Should recruitment be conducted in different areas within the state?
	Should recruitment be conducted inside/outside the agency, state service, or the state?
	Should recruitment be conducted regionally or nationally?
	Will recruitment announcements reach enough potential applicants and provide quality candidates?
	How many candidates might be attracted by word of mouth?
	Note: Often the best candidate is not seeking a job, looking at job listings, or reading the classifieds. The probability is great that the best workers are not out of work. These people can be found through referrals and direct contacts. The job location, agency, and Washington State must be marketed to them in a way to make them prefer it to their current position. The prospective candidates must be approached professionally.
	Can agency-internal recruiting through electronic mail (E-mail), bulletin boards, or other internal distribution systems be used?
	Will networking or exchanges with special interest groups be needed or beneficial?
	Is the use of specific mailing lists, or newsletters to protected groups, networks or organizations, and/or professional associations an effective alternative to target specific pockets of candidates?
	Are there appropriate job fairs, career days, or planned professional meetings nearby?
	Are there workshops, town meetings, conferences, or training seminars where presentations or ad distributions could be effective?

Is using public service announcements on the broadcast media a potential resource?
Note: Public service announcements via radio or TV might be used in specific instances for targeting protected or other applicant groups. Local public radio and television broadcasting, when available, may not be effective for all types of skills. Pay particular attention to broadcast times to ensure availability to the proposed candidate audience.
Will college recruitment be effective for entry-level management positions?
<u>Note:</u> If so, it is important to recruit early for college graduates since many of the top students have job commitments by spring of their graduation year.
Will newspapers be a good source?
Note: Classified ads in newspapers can usually be placed within a few days. They can be expensive, but may be a particularly good way to reach special populations such as bilingual candidates or other candidates with specialized skills.
Are professional journals or other publications good or timely sources? When trying to target a specific group or type of candidates (e.g., medical professions, scientists or engineers), professional journals and publications can enable one to reach better qualified candidates. Cost and timing are important considerations.
<u>Note:</u> Ads in trade or professional journals are costly, both in time and money. There is usually at least an eight-week delay in publishing an advertisement in a journal, and it can cost hundreds of dollars.
Recruitment announcements listed with the Department of Personnel will reach many people at less cost to the agency than a newspaper advertisement. However, if seeking a more specialized group with distinct characteristics, it may be best to spend the dollars on special mailing lists or on journal or newspaper advertising.
issues to consider in recruitment planning where problems are anticipated or revious recruitments have failed:
Sometimes recruitment may not be the best option for meeting an agency's need to fill a position.
In other instances, special measures may be required to obtain qualified candidates.

	In cases where severe recruitment problems exist, consideration may need to be given to changes in the desired qualifications or salary, or perhaps even the structure of the job itself.
Other o	ptions to consider to expand or improve the recruitment:
	Open recruitment indefinitely rather than limiting the recruitment period if you anticipate few candidates or several openings.
	Publish informational notes on announcements designed to attract applicants; e.g., a positive description of the position, working conditions, and benefits, or even information about the geographic location or developmental opportunities.
	Accept candidates who don't technically meet the desired qualifications, but who may have potential that would make them effective candidates.
Conside	rations for limiting or targeting recruitment:
	Avoid wide scale advertisement of an opening if the target group is small.
	Use self-screen notes on announcements or advertising that describe aspects of the job that may not be desirable for all candidates.
	Use localized rather than centralized recruitment.
	Consider other options in lieu of recruitment such as succession planning, a good mentoring program, rotational or developmental assignments, and temporary appointments.
	Mix wide announcements internally with targeted advertisement outside—a good way to meet internal morale issues and diversity outreach as well.
Basic inf	formation for the recruitment announcement (or advertisement):
	Most job announcements include the title, salary, duties description, location, agency information, qualities sought in candidates, and application instructions.
	Provide information about the availability of alternate formats and accommodations for persons of disability.
	If the expected process for candidate selection will take several steps, it is advisable to include a description of the process in the announcement. An alternative is to include the date by which candidates can expect to hear from you. (Either can reduce the number of phone calls which may result from a recruitment, and more importantly, improve communications with, and treatment of, candidates.)

	Use specific information in the recruitment announcement. When candidates have a clear idea about what qualities are being sought, fewer unqualified persons will apply.					
Conside	Considerations in conducting the assessment process:					
	Use the same criteria for all candidates at each step of the process.					
	Note: However, remain open to changes that may need to occur. Let's assume you anticipated ten candidates and on this basis had decided to administer an oral interview to all who met basic requirements. You are surprised by receiving thirty well qualified candidates. While you may decide to interview all thirty in one case, in another you may wish to screen the pool to ten or twelve.					
	Make sure that raters or interviewers are not potential candidates for the job and reflect the diversity you seek in your candidates.					
	Ensure that raters or interviewers are knowledgeable about the requirements of the job and are familiar with the assessment tool and criteria being used. In many circumstances, it is also important to convey to raters the confidential nature of the selection process.					
	Make sure that all the most important qualifications get considered. Do not let the latest or the most dramatic evidence overwhelm other important information acquired about the candidates.					
	Communicate with candidates at each step of the selection process.					
	Note: It is common courtesy and good business to keep candidates apprised of what is happening in the recruitment. Acknowledge receipt of their applications and keep them informed about the schedule of the process. Candidates should not be allowed to wonder whether they have been forgotten. Maintain rapport with the candidates throughout the process. Candidates who finish in the top but are not selected may be good choices for future jobs.					
	When candidates have been eliminated from consideration, they should be notified.					
	Note: Finalists should be informed as soon as the appointment is made—from the hiring authority, not through the grapevine.					
	formation is available in publications listed in the Resource section or you may OOP staff if you need further assistance.					

 $\frac{2}{12}$

Step 6: Monitor and Evaluate the Recruitment

Once the decisions that put the actual recruitment process into motion have been made, the work is still not complete. Recruitments must always be monitored, new ones especially closely. Any problems that occur, and anything that worked very well, should be noted for future reference.

Monitor the steps and progress of the recruitment. Are any unanticipated problems occurring? How could they have been avoided? Be sure to record things that worked well or didn't work very well. Once the hiring decision has been made, evaluate how well the plan worked. Did it achieve the desired results? Were there any particular problems? Was the candidate who was chosen successful on the job? All this information should be kept to assist in planning future recruitments.

Step 7: Record the Results and Notify DOP

The Department of Personnel tracks applicants by protected group status throughout the selection process. Agencies will need to keep similar records, as well as records on final hiring decisions. Agencies are encouraged to develop policies on what information they will keep, where it will be kept, and for how long.

Besides the basic information on numbers and protected group status of applicants at the different stages of the hiring process, there may be other information that the agency would find useful. Examples include: how information distribution or advertising was conducted, any comments or inquiries from applicants about the process, how long it took, satisfaction with results, etc. It is also important to keep records that show the job-relatedness of the procedures used to screen applicants and arrive at the final decision.

In summary, key elements to record are:

- Results of the Evaluation of Job Requirements.
- Assessment tools used.
- Recruitment methods used.
- Numbers and protected group status of applicants at each stage of screening.
- Any problems and how they were resolved.
- Final hiring decision.
- All personnel actions for positions and incumbents.
- Position number and title for all WMS positions.

WAC 356-56-650 requires agencies to maintain records of employees in the Washington Management Service, identifying them as WMS employees, including position numbers and position titles, and tracking all personnel actions. The WAC also requires agencies to report statistical information to the Department of Personnel regarding diversity, applicant flow, and appointments following each selection. Forwarding this information to DOP will allow DOP to provide consolidated information on the WMS as requested by the Governor's office or the Legislature.

To assist agencies in the collection, forwarding, and compilation of the information required by WAC 356-56-650, a sample form is included on page 5-28. Agencies may use this form or develop their own.

■ Form for Reporting Appointments to DOP

Date: Provided by:
Agency: Phone #:
WMS Band Level: WMSI WMSII WMSIV
Position Number: Position Title:
Candidates Considered:
Total Number Considered:
Agency Promotional Service-wide Promotional Open Competitive
Black Hispanic Native American Asian Caucasian
Male Female Persons with Disability
Veteran Vietnam Veteran Disabled Veteran
Candidate Appointed: (Circle the appropriate answers)
Ethnicity/Race: Black Hispanic Native American Asian Caucasian
Sex: Male Female
Person with Disability: Yes No
Veteran: Yes No Vietnam Veteran: Yes No
Disabled Veteran: Yes No
Prior Status: Agency Promotional Service-wide Promotional Open Competitive
Appointee's Name:
Please forward the completed form to the Department of Personnel, Attention: WMS

Clearinghouse, MS: 47500, 1-2. If you have any questions about the form or its use, please call (360) 753-2303.

Acting Appointments to WMS Positions

An interim or acting appointment may be more appropriate than a permanent appointment under certain circumstances. Some examples include when an employee is on extended sick leave or family leave; when extensive recruitment is anticipated to take several weeks; when there is uncertainty regarding continued funding for a position; when a reorganization is pending; when there is a grant or project; and, other temporary situations where a permanent appointment is not appropriate.

The WMS rules do not specify a time limit for acting appointments. The agency or hiring authority has discretion to determine the length of such appointments. In doing so, the effect on employee morale, service delivery, employee benefits, and productivity should be taken into consideration.

Written notification to the appointee must indicate the length of the acting appointment. It should also include a qualifying statement that unforeseen circumstances could shorten or extend the expected time frame. Notification should cover conditions of employment including whether or not benefits will be paid. The existing agency policy may serve as a guide for determining the issue of benefits.

Acting appointments may be made from outside state service, from general service classified employees, or from within the WMS. Appointees from outside state service will not gain permanent status as a result of an acting appointment. Permanent employees have the right to resume their previous position or a similar position at the conclusion of their acting appointment.

If the WMS employee is in a review period at the time of the acting appointment, the letter should explain how the appointment will affect the review period. Agencies have the flexibility to decide whether the acting appointment is similar to the permanent one and, therefore, should be considered part of the initial review period.

WMS Job Information Clearinghouse

The WMS Job Information Clearinghouse, located at the Department of Personnel, offers a variety of services to job seekers and agencies regarding WMS employment opportunities and potential candidates for WMS jobs. Recruitment and selection activities in the Washington Management Service are conducted by each state agency. The WMS Job Information Clearinghouse offers a central source of information. Agency use of these services is optional.

Overview of Services Offered to Agencies

- Skills bank of managerial candidates to consider when filling WMS positions.
 - Summary profiles of candidates' qualifications.
 - Candidate names and phone numbers.
 - Mailing labels of potential candidates.
 - Resume file for agency review.
- Recruitment announcements posted at DOP office in Olympia.
- Recruitment announcements distributed as appropriate.
- Address labels of protected group organizations.
- Consultative services upon request.
- Reports on numbers and types of applicants in the skills bank.

Overview of Services Offered to Applicants

- General information about the WMS program.
- Single location to submit resumes.
- Placement on central skills bank for consideration by hiring agencies.
- Postings of recruitment announcements for WMS openings.
- Recruitment announcements listed on voice mail for call-in clients.
- Phone-in convenience to check on advertised openings; 24 hours a day, seven days a week.
- Brochure/application packet available to interested applicants.
- Reports on WMS hires.

Samples of the WMS Candidate Skills Bank Data Sheet and instructions are included at the back of this chapter.

WMS Candidate Skills Bank

Hiring authorities and agency recruiters can tap the skills bank as a potential source of candidates for WMS vacancies. The skills bank contains the names of persons interested in exploring job opportunities in the Washington Management Service. In addition to names, it includes addresses, phone numbers, diversity information, education and experience background, subject areas, geographic location interests and resumes.

Agencies can receive mailing labels to send job announcements and initial screening questions to potential candidates. Resumes are also on file at DOP for agency recruiters to review. By submitting the WMS Skill Bank Request form (sample on page 5-32), agencies can receive the names of persons with specific backgrounds.

Assistance with Recruitment Announcements

Agencies are welcome to post recruitment announcements of their WMS vacancies in the lobby at the Department of Personnel facility at 600 South Franklin in Olympia. Agencies should provide an adequate number of job announcements for this purpose (usually 125–150 copies for a two-week period). Call DOP at 753-2303 to coordinate.

Upon request, DOP will also distribute recruitment announcements statewide or on a targeted basis (e.g., to certain agencies or geographic locations only). The announcements would be distributed with DOP's General Service job announcement distribution. Openings can also be placed on the job line. To discuss these options, contact your team in the DOP Personnel Services Division.

DOP will also provide address labels for protected group organizations to facilitate targeted recruitment for WMS positions.

The WMS Job Information Clearinghouse is located at the Department of Personnel, 521 Capitol Way South, Olympia, WA, 98504-7530. For further information, call (360) 753-2303.

Mailing Labels Desired: Yes

Chapter 5: Recruitment, Selection, and Employee Movement

WMS Skill Bank Request Form

Send to WMS Clearinghouse, Department of Personnel, MS: 47500, 1-2

No

5 - 32 2/12/96

■ Resources

WHO TO CONSULT FOR ASSISTANCE

Your own agency personnel staff

<u>Selection Specialists, Washington State Department of Personnel</u> (360) 586-2366

Executive Search Services, Washington State Department of Personnel (360) 664-0394

RECRUITING

<u>Personnel Procedures</u>, Washington State Department of Personnel, 5/89. A reference and developmental tool for current Department of Personnel staff and agency Personnel Managers. Provides both the conceptual and procedural tasks that Department of Personnel analysts perform. Includes recruitment strategies, oral, essay, and E&T exams, administering exams, and exam scores, as well as classification issues.

<u>Effective Recruitment Ads in the 90's.</u> State of Washington-Workforce 2000 Team, 6/91. Tips for carefully defining an agency's selling points and effectively targeting the best medium for the message.

<u>Tips for College and University On-Campus Recruiting</u>, Washington State Department of Personnel-College Days Project-Workforce 2000, 9/92. A handbook which provides potential recruiters with tips to assist them in educating and attracting those highest-qualified college and university graduates to employment with the State of Washington.

<u>Shifting the Recruitment Paradigm-Recruiting for Hard-To-Fill Positions</u>, State of Washington Department of Personnel, 1/93. A handbook of nontraditional approaches for success with hard-to-fill positions, and attracting affirmative action applicants.

<u>Systemic Validity</u>, Washington State Department of Personnel, 3/93. A booklet which causes you to think about the whole picture, assessing the quality of your selection processes.

DIVERSITY

Affirmative Action Planning Guidance, Washington State Department of Personnel, Workforce Diversity Program, 4/93. This manual contains information you need to know in planning for a results-oriented affirmative action program. State employers must be committed to making good faith efforts to attain and maintain equal employment opportunity.

<u>The Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) and Employment</u>, Washington State Department of Personnel, Workforce Diversity Program, 4/92. A technical assistance manual with detailed interpretive guidance regarding employment and the ADA.

Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA)...Essential Functions Guidelines, Washington State Department of Personnel, 2/93. A key requirement of the ADA is that a person covered under the Act cannot be denied employment solely because s/he cannot perform a function that is "marginal" to the job. This booklet will help guide you in determining the "essential" functions of the position you plan to fill prior to all recruitment actions.

ASSESSING APPLICANTS

<u>EEOC Uniform Guidelines on Selection</u>, Guidelines on the federal validation requirements for employee assessment and hiring practices.

<u>Developing Evaluations of Experience and Training (E&T) Exams</u>, Washington State Department of Personnel. A manual which covers everything from performing an analysis of the job, and writing the exam, to determining the exam's validity.

<u>Oral Exam Development Manual</u>, Schultz, C.B., Washington State Department of Personnel, 11/83. A guide for developing valid oral exams.

INTERVIEWING

<u>Pre-Employment Inquiries and Screening</u>, Washington State Human Rights Commission. Regulations concerning pre-employment inquiries and preventing practices having a high potential for discrimination

<u>Improving the Interview</u>, Valadez, C.L., Washington State Department of Personnel, 2/87. A manual which provides helpful tips for developing and carrying out valid, jobrelated interviews which comply with EEO guidelines.

■ Sample Recruitment Scenarios

Agency Promotional

You have a program area that is highly specialized. You normally hire at the entry level and train employees in your environment. When you have hired from outside at the higher levels in this program, there have been multiple problems. You have several employees who are ready to compete for a managerial position in this program.

In this case, you will most likely find your best candidates internally. This situation may even provide an opportunity for succession planning. Any plans for recruiting outside would need to build in how to resolve problems experienced previously.

Target Recruiting

Historically your agency has primarily filled managerial vacancies on a promotional basis. Due to past hiring decisions, filling vacancies in this manner has meant you now have few protected group candidates to consider internally. The position you have now does not require in-house knowledge. There are several promotional candidates. You have many goals not yet met at this level.

In this situation, a recruitment targeting only your promotional candidates and protected group candidates could work well. You need to ensure that in-house knowledge is not part of the screening process if it is not required on the job. Your Affirmative Action Office or DOP Workforce Diversity office can provide information on conducting target recruitment.

Extensive Recruitment

You have a very special need for a good manager with a specific technical background that few have. Your agency promotional candidates have a working knowledge but are not experts to the degree needed. Or, you have a brand new program that needs to be set up from ground zero, and none of your employees have this kind of expertise.

In these two situations, recruitment outside is likely your best approach. How widespread you need to search or advertise will depend on how many candidates you think you might identify. For the first situation, since few people possess this knowledge you may need to search and advertise nationwide. For the second situation, a statewide or Northwest regional recruitment could be sufficient.

I Use of Outside Assistance in Employee Selection

To fill any position someone must spend time planning, organizing and carrying out candidate appraisal and selection. An untrained staff member may take some time to figure out what to do, then do a respectable job of it. A specialist who has done it many times before does the job quickly and systematically. A selection specialist enumerates the job requirements, determines where to find the best candidates, prepares an announcement that attracts the best and discourages the mediocre candidates, and designs a method to evaluate candidate qualifications.

The qualities it takes to perform well in a position are not always easy to identify. And assessing which candidate best demonstrates those qualities is more difficult. To develop a strategy to find the ideal employee, a person has to be analytical and sensitive to nuances in communication. It helps to know what procedures have proven effective and legally defensible.

Some agencies already have staff who are well-versed in employee selection. For those needing additional support, the Department of Personnel has a trained staff of selection specialists who can assist you with your selection needs, or with training your current staff.

You also may have an occasional selection situation where you would consider using a consultant or purchasing a test. If you are considering this, DOP selection staff can also assist you in analyzing needs and evaluating products.